

University of Denver

**Digital Commons @ DU**

---

Musicology and Ethnomusicology: Student  
Scholarship

Musicology and Ethnomusicology

---

11-2020

## The Myers-Briggs of Quoting: A Typology of Musical Borrowing in Jazz Improvisation

University of Denver

Follow this and additional works at: [https://digitalcommons.du.edu/musicology\\_student](https://digitalcommons.du.edu/musicology_student)



Part of the **Musicology Commons**



This work is licensed under a **Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License**.

---

## The Myers-Briggs of Quoting: A Typology of Musical Borrowing in Jazz Improvisation

---

## The Myers-Briggs of Quoting: A Typology of Musical Borrowing in Jazz Improvisation

Myers-Briggs is a personality identifying test that uses a set of either-or criteria to create an abbreviation where each letter defines one portion of the personality, the culmination being a, hopefully, accurate descriptor of the person. I plan to take this either-or criteria culminating in an encompassing abbreviation approach to analyzing the use of quotation in jazz improvisation. The word, quoting, is most oft mentioned as an overarching explanation of musical borrowing in jazz, but I have found that the uses, implications, and outcomes vary wildly. This paper will provide a new typology of these types of quoting to allow a more effective, efficient, and encompassing analysis of musical borrowing in the idiom of jazz improvisation.

### *Annotated Bibliography*

**Carroll, Charles Michael. "Musical Borrowing-Grand Larceny or Great Art?" *College Music Symposium* 18, no. 1 (1978): 11-18. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/40373912>.**

Charles Carroll's article for the College Music Symposium is one of the first examples of modern academic writing about musical borrowing. While Carroll was not necessarily a grand figure in music academia, he was a well researched music scholar whose publishing in this respected journal showcases his validity. Rather than move through justifications or analysis of musical borrowing, Carroll introduces a question. It is this question of purpose and perception that nearly all later writings on the subject attempt to answer or further elaborate. While Carroll does not move into the world of jazz improvisation, this article seems to be a launching pad for the conversation to come.

**Burkholder, J. Peter. "The Uses of Existing Music: Musical Borrowing as a Field." *Notes* 50, no. 3 (1994): 851-70. doi:10.2307/898531.**

If Charles Carroll introduced the question and launched the conversation in his article, this writing by J. Peter Burkholder introduces the conversation as worthy of study. It is with this article that Burkholder establishes a specialty and focus. With his rise to prominence in the field of musicology via professorships at such schools as Indiana University, Burkholder's musical borrowing specialty is given further validity, and this paper can be viewed as an initial roadmap in the hindsight of his academic success. Burkholder, similarly to Carroll, fails to give genuine recognition to jazz. Despite the lack of connection to my topic through genre, Burkholder's paper will be the most foundational to my writing. In the appendices of his article, Burkholder introduces a typology of musical borrowing.

Rather than come to a succinct answer, Burkholder introduces questions that should be asked and introduces the idea of a typology; I plan to provide clarity and completeness to his introduction.

**Burkholder, J. Peter. "Allusion in American Music." *Grove Music Online*. Edited by Deane Root. July 25, 2013; Accessed November 3, 2020.**

**<https://www-oxfordmusiconline-com.du.idm.oclc.org/grovemusic/view/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.001.0001/omo-9781561592630-e-1002240025>.**

While this is a very brief article, this writing by J. Peter Burkholder gives academic validity to non-western art music, and particularly American music, in the scholarly discussion of musical borrowing. By the time of the publishing of this article, Burkholder was established as a leading figure in the field of musical borrowing, and his stamp of recognition towards a contemporary music allows the conversation to move closer in direction towards my topic.

**Potter, Gary. "Analyzing Improvised Jazz." *College Music Symposium* 32 (1992): 143-60.**

**<http://www.jstor.org/stable/40374206>.**

Published before Burkholder's writings on musical borrowing, Gary Potter's, "Analyzing Improvised Jazz," joins in an entirely different academic conversation. While Potter is attempting to provide light to unique and challenging features in jazz improvisation, he is unknowingly directly contributing to the field of musical borrowing, and particularly important to specific forms of quotation to be written about in my paper. Potter showcases the beginnings and dominance of self-quotation through motivic development via jazz greats Sonny Rollins and John Coltrane. Potter's article is obviously written from a jazz theorists perspective that is well researched but singular in goal. I will extrapolate this singular goal and use it to directly inform my writings on quotation of self through jazz improvisation.

**Murphy, John P. "Jazz Improvisation: The Joy of Influence." *The Black Perspective in Music* 18, no. 1/2 (1990): 7-19. doi:10.2307/1214855.**

Just as Gary Potter wrote before Burkholder within a different conversation, John P. Murphy's article comes before Potter's. While not as distantly related as Potter to Burkholder, Murphy and Potter are connecting through the topic of jazz improvisation. Surprisingly, though, Potter's article will more directly correlate with my paper, despite the innate focus of influence in this article of Murphy's. The influence he most accurately describes, which makes sense when understanding the journal in which it was published, is the African influence in modern jazz improvisation. Rather than

create a foundation of my paper, this article has poked a hole in my initial thoughts. Murphy's article forces me to reflect on the historical influence on improvisation, and at what point is this influence quoting.

**Evans, Bill. *Peace Piece*. Transcription by Jim Aikin. Rev. ed. Fausto Borém. *Contemporary Keyboard* n.28, 15-20. Brazil: Per Musi, 1980.**

Moving beyond the academic writings, the most important contribution to the conversation I am attempting to join and for which I intend to create a typology is the music itself. There is often mystery surrounding the compositional origins of songs within the world of Bill Evans and Miles Davis. This ambiguity is another hole in my typology. "Peace Piece" is a modal song that centers around an ostinato bass and harmony line in C Ionian. The whole piece is an improvisation over the top of this ostinato. Miles Davis' explored this same style, particularly on the album *Kind of Blue*, on which Evans played. "Peace Piece" creates a foundation for which ambiguous quoting can occur.

**Davis, Miles. "Flamenco Sketches." *Kind of Blue*. Recorded in 1959. Columbia CS 8163, 1959. LP Album.**

As mentioned in the context of "Peace Piece," Miles Davis musically borrowed much from Bill Evans. Davis took the main ostinato theme of "Peace Piece" and used it as the introduction and beginning of the form of his modal piece, "Flamenco Sketches." While improvisation is usually thought of in relation to a melodic line, this juxtaposition of two improvised compositions showcases quotation as relating to bass and harmony while still holding true to the improvisatory nature of my paper.

**Brown, Clifford, trumpet. "Jordu." *Clifford Brown and Max Roach*. Recorded in 1954. Emarcy MG2 6043, 1954. 10" Album.**

Just as "Peace Piece" set forth opportunity for future musicians to borrow, Clifford Brown's entire repertoire of soloing created a vocabulary for future jazz musicians to quote. Brown's solo on "Jordu" is stuffed full of jazz language that is integral to the genre, but there is one lick in particular that is frequently quoted in honor of the legend of Clifford Brown. This lick occurs at the 1:10 time marker in this track.

**Morgan, Lee, trumpet. "Moanin'." *Art Blakey and the Jazz Messengers*. Recorded in 1958. Blue Note BLP 4003, 1959. LP Album.**

While Lee Morgan was an accomplished jazz trumpeter in his own right and gave inspiration to many musicians to come, he also was musically indebted to the great bop musicians before him. One of the greatest inspirations on Morgan was Clifford Brown. The aforementioned “Jordu” lick played by Brown is quoted by Morgan on this recording of “Moanin’” at the 2:41 time marker. This is an example of a quote that is not out of humor or motivic development, but instead an homage to inspiration.

**Hargrove, Roy, trumpet. *Roy Hargrove Quintet - Strasbourg St. Denis (2007 New Morning in Paris)*. Posted October 16, 2020. Video. [https://youtu.be/DP\\_NRCxmAA4](https://youtu.be/DP_NRCxmAA4).**

Morgan was quoting straight out of the tradition he was stepping into, but decades later Roy Hargrove was a trumpeter who was entering the modern form of the jazz trumpet timeline. While Hargrove could play bop lines at the highest level, he found much of his fame through the crossover between jazz and hip-hop. This recording of his composition, “Strasbourg St. Denis,” shows the hip-hop influence coming through his jazz improvisation. There are multiple quotes throughout this solo, but two that stick out are the melody of “Strawberry Letter 23” by The Brothers Johnson and “The Message” by Grandmaster Flash. Hargrove’s solo is a perfect example of the quoting of songs outside the jazz tradition within the context of jazz improvisation.

**Ellington, Duke. *Take the “A” Train*. Recorded in 1957. RCA Victor EPA 5002, 1958. 7” 45RPM Single.**

Similar to Bill Evans’ platform of borrowing, Duke Ellington’s sheer prominence in the world of recorded jazz, he is bound to be countlessly quoted. One particular quote that has turned into a cliché is the ending to his piece, “Take the ‘A’ Train”. This ending is often subbed into the ending of other tunes in the live setting, or by a soloist to cap off their improvisation. This is an example of musical borrowing that is so widely known that is often done in a tongue-in-cheek fashion to create a joke at the end of a musical statement.

**Heitlinger, Alex. *The Lick*. November 12, 2011. Video. <https://youtu.be/krDxhnaKD7Q>.**

While the “Take the ‘A’ Train” ending became a joke over a long history of overuse, this video by Alex Heitlinger introduced the largest joke in modern jazz improvisation. He discovered that this phrase, dubbed “the lick,” has been played by countless jazz musicians in their improvisation without specific quotational purposes. “The Lick” can now be heard in live performances as jazz musicians try

to insight a laugh from the other musicians on stage and in the audience alike. This is, without a doubt, the most oft utilized quote that I have encountered in my experience in the jazz improvisation idiom.